Hartley is a lifelong member of Westminster Presbyterian Church having joined when his father was called to be the senior pastor in 1973. Hartley was confirmed at Westminster and is an ordained Elder who has served on the Westminster Session for two active sessions.

Hartley and his wife Carolyn Griffin Hall were married in 1992 and have one daughter, Grace Griffin Hall (23), who was also confirmed at Westminster. Carolyn is an ordained Elder (as were her mother and father) and has served actively on the Session of Westminster, as well as many other roles including on the trusteeship of the Legacy Fund.

Hartley served on the inaugural Board of Trustees of the Legacy Fund and was its original Co-Chair from 2012 to 2015. Hartley has served on one call committee (Carson Salyer) and has taught several Sunday School classes, notably the New Member class for 5 plus years.

Formally retired as a Managing Director in the Investment Bank of Citigroup since October 2019, Hartley serves on the board of Rooftops Nashville and on the alumni board of Montgomery Bell Academy.